Heavy Fermion Physics – Perspectives from look-alikes

> Andy Schofield University of Birmingham







The Leverhulme Trust

The chemical history of a candle

COURSE OF SIX LECTURES

CHEMICAL HISTORY OF A CANDLE:

ON THE

TO WHICH IS ADDED

A LECTURE ON PLATINUM.

BY

MICHAEL FARADAY, D.C.L., F.R.S.,

FULLERIAN PROFESSION OF CHEMISTRY, ROYAL INSTITUTION; FOREION ASSOCIATE OF THE ACADEMY OF SCIENCES, ETC.

Delivered before a JUVENILE AUDITORY at the ROYAL INSTITUTION of GREAT BRITAIN during the Christman Holidays of 1860-1.

EDITED BY WILLIAM CROOKES, F.C.S.

WITH NUMEROUS ILLUSTRATIONS.

LONDON: GRIFFIN, BOHN, AND COMPANY, STATIONERS' HALL COURT. MDCCCLXI. "There is no better, there is no more open door by which you can enter into the study of natural philosophy than by considering the physical phenomena of a candle." Michael Faraday 1860





Heavy fermions – a universe of correlated electron physics

"There is no better, there is no more open door by which you can enter into the study of correlated electrons than by considering the physical phenomena of the heavy fermions."

- Fermi liquids
- Novel Superconductors
- Quantum critical metals conventional and unconventional
- "Hidden order" phases
- Significant challenges
- Insights from look-alikes can we build simple analogues?
- Future Trends:
 - Analogue heavy fermion systems
 - Semiconductors; cold atoms
 - New experimental techniques

The basic Hamiltonian

• The Anderson lattice model:

$$H = \sum_{ij\sigma} \epsilon_{ij} c_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} c_{j\sigma} - \sum_{ij\sigma} \left[V_{ij} c_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} f_{j\sigma} + V_{ij}^{*} f_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} c_{j\sigma} \right] - \Delta \sum_{i\sigma} f_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} f_{i\sigma} + U \sum_{i} f_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} f_{i\sigma} f_{i\sigma} f_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} f_{i\sigma} f_{i\sigma} f_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} f_{i\sigma} f$$

- Essential ingredients
 - Non-interacting conduction electrons (c)
 - Strongly interacting f electrons usually considered in the limit of large U and Δ (so valence fluctuations small) with no direct f-f hybridization
 - Weak hybridization between f and c.
- Reduces to:
 - Local moments with spin degrees of freedom interacting via magnetic exchange with the conduction electrons

How is the spin entropy of the f moments lost as T->0?

P. Coleman, C. Pépin, Q. Si & R. Ramazashvili; J. Phys. C. 13 R723 (2001)



Free spins order, and N_c=N_c (small Fermi volume) Low temperatures No free spins but very heavy electrons (m $\sim 10^3 m_e$) and N_e=N_c+N_f (large Fermi volume)

The remarkable Fermi liquid: UPt₃

A heavy Fermi liquid: $U\sim 5 f^3$

High temp: f electrons bound to form a local moment via Hund's rule (\sim 1eV):







A Fermi liquid susceptible to superconductivity

Superconductivity in the Presence of Strong Pauli Paramagnetism: CeCu₂Si₂

F. Steglich

Institut für Festkörperphysik, Technische Hochschule Darmstadt, D-6100 Darmstadt, West Germany

and

J. Aarts, C. D. Bredl, W. Lieke, D. Meschede, and W. Franz II. Physikalisches Institut, Universität zu Köln, D-5000 Köln 41, West Germany

and

H. Schäfer Eduard-Zintl-Institut, Technische Hochschule Darmstadt, D-6100 Darmstadt, West Germany (Received 10 August 1979; revised manuscript received 7 November 1979)





A universe of new superconductors



Christian Pfleiderer Rev. Mod. Phys. 81, #4, 1551-1624 (2009). Superconductors that require new rules:

- On the border of magnetism
 - AFM: CePd₂Si₂
 - FM: UCoGe
- Coexisting with magnetism
 - AFM: UPt₃
 - FM: UGe₂
- Non-centrosymmetric
 - CePt₃Si
- "High temperature" superconductors
 - PuCoGa₅

Exemplars of quantum criticality

H. v. Löhneysen, T. Pietrus, G. Portisch, H. G. Schlager, A. Schröder, M. Sieck and T. Trappmann Phys. Rev. Lett. **72**, #20, 3262-3265 (1994).

e.g. pressure tuned CePd₂Si₂



S.R.Julian et al. J. Phys.:cond. matt. 8, 9675 (1996).

Are heavy fermion materials simply metals with small $E_{\rm F}$?

Many outstanding puzzles – like UBe₁₃





Superconductivity without a Fermi surface?

Are heavy fermion materials simply metals with small E_{F} ?

Many outstanding puzzles – like the mysterious order in URu₂Si₂



URu₂Si₂: T. T. M. Palstra, A. A. Menovsky, J. van den Berg, A. J. Dirkmaat, P. H. Kes, G. J. Nieuwenhuys and J. A. Mydosh Physical Review Letters **55**, 2727 (1985)

LGWH: Failure in heavy fermion AFM



Von Löhneysen et al. J. Phys: Condens. Matt. 8, 9689 (1996)

... yet E/T scaling seen

Schröder et al, Nature 407,351 (2000)



Physics <u>below</u> the upper critical dimension.



... and seems show criticality everywhere in k-space



Evidence for new physics at a heavy fermion quantum critical point

P. Gegenwart, T. Westerkamp, C. Krellner, Y. Tokiwa, S. Paschen, C. Geibel, F. Steglich, E. Abrahams, Q. Si Science **315**, #5814, 969-971 (2007).



An additional energy scale appears to converge on the quantum phase transition: Failure of the Landau assumption of a single order parameter controlling criticality

Phase diagram appears even richer

It looks like you can control the two scales independently



S. Friedemann, T. Westerkamp, M. Brando, N. Oeschler, S. Wirth, P. Gegenwart, C. Krellner, C. Geibel and F. Steglich Nature Physics **5**, #7, 465-469 (2009).

Moreover – evidence of E/T scaling



Sven Friedemann et al. PNAS, 107, 14547 (2010)



Using analogues to understand the physics

- Are the anomalies seen in quantum critical heavy fermion metals a consequence of Kondo physics OR a generic failure of our understanding of quantum criticality?
- Is there a "look alike" for quantum criticality without the Kondo physics?
 - *d*-metals near a magnetic instability
 - AFM?
 - FM? (issues of non-analyticity)
- Is there a "look-alike" for the Kondo lattice which illustrates the same physics?
 - ³He bilayers

Quantum criticality in metallic systems

- Paramagnon theory (1960s onward):
 - metals on the border of ferromagnetism.
 - Pd, Ni₃Al, Ni₃Ga, YNi₃, ZrZn₂
 - Puzzles: neither Stoner nor Heisenberg-like
 - Stoner: $B=a M + b M^3$ with $a \sim a_0 \lambda (T/TF)2$
 - T_c small, χ Curie-Weiss like, yet μ_{eff}/μ_0 large
 - Resolution: include spin-fluctuations
 - Berk, Schrieffer, Doniach, Engelsberg, Rice, Moriya, Yamada, Beal-Monod, Misawa, Lonzarich, Continentino ... and more
 - $B=(a+b \langle m \rangle^2) M + b M^3$
 - Modern incarnation: Hertz-Millis (RG) approach

$$S = \int \sum_{\omega} d^D q \left[\left(\left(x - x_c \right) + q^2 + \frac{i\omega}{q^{z-2}} \right) |\psi|^2 + u |\psi|^4 + \cdots \right]$$

LGWH: Landau-Ginzburg-Wilson-Hertz (...)

Itinerant antiferromagnetic quantum criticality ($Q \neq 0$)

Hilbert v. Löhneysen, Achim Rosch, Matthias Vojta, Peter Wölfle Rev. Mod. Phys. **79**, 1015-1075 (2007).

Interplay between spin-fluctuations and the electron fluid

- LGWH: Upper critical dimension should formally be 2
- At *d*=2:
 - Long range interactions induced by fluid,
 LGWH expansion breaks down (infinite number of marginal operators)
 - Abanov and Chubukov, Phys Rev Lett 93, 255702 (2004)
- At *d*=3:
 - Breakdown of Fermi liquid at hot spots need to treat fully self-consistently
- At $Q=2k_F$:
 - d=2 First order:
 - Ioffe, Millis Phys. Rev. B 51, 16151 (1995).

Ferromagnetic quantum critical points (Q=0)

- Coupling to soft modes: particle-hole excitations in the spin channel:
 - $-F \rightarrow F_{\text{conventional}} + w \ m^4 \ln (m^2/m_0^2 + T^2/T_0^2)$
 - D. Belitz, T.R. Kirkpatrick, Jorg Röllbühler, PRL 94, 247205 (2005) and references therein.

Reminiscent of other fluctuation induced first order transitions.

- Non-analytic action in q: e.g. $d=3 \rightarrow q^2 \ln q$
 - $d=2 \rightarrow -|q|^{3/2} m_q^2$ at QCP. |q| near QCP.
 - A. V. Chubukov, C. Pépin, J. Rech, PRL 92, 147003 (2004).
 D. Belitz, T. R. Kirkpatrick, and T. Vojta, Phys. Rev. B 55, 9452 (1997).
- Over counting? No observe corrections in Fermi liquid theory.
 - G.Y.Chitov and A. J. Millis, PRB 64, 054414 (2001).
- Special pleading: Negative curvature of the density of states Conclusion: generically driven first order, or order parameter must "curl up". But you can find a true LGWH quantum critical point at finite magnetic field.

S. A. Grigera, A. P. Mackenzie, A. J. Schofield, S. R. Julian and G. G. Lonzarich Int. J. Mod. Phys. B 16, 3258-3264 (2002).

D. Belitz *et al.* Phys. Rev. Lett. 94, 247205 (2005)

Generic phase diagram



LGWH: successes – ZrZn₂ a clean itinerant FM (>1K) A Marginal Fermi Liquid



R. P. Smith, M. Sutherland, G. G. Lonzarich, S. S. Saxena, N. Kimura, S. Takashima, M. Nohara and H. Takagi Nature **455**, #7217, 1220-1223 (2008).

Exposing physics normally too weak to see: e.g. Michael Reizer (1989)

See: Non-Fermi liquids A. J. Schofield Contemp. Phys. 40, #2, 95-115 (1999).

The Ruddlesden-Popper Series: Sr_{1+n}Ru_nO_{1+3n}



Generating quantum criticality



Example: **CePd₂Si₂** Antiferromagnetism tuned by pressure.

[S. R. Julian et. al. J. Phys. C. (1996)]



[S.A. Grigera *et al.*, Science (2001)]

The metamagnetic quantum critical end-point (QCEP)

Theory of the metamagnetic quantum critical endpoint: A.J. Millis, A. J. Schofield, G.G. Lonzarich and S.A. Grigera, Phys. Rev. Lett. **88**, 217204 (2002)



S.I.Ikeda, Y.Maeno, A.J.Millis,

Science, 294, 329 (2001).

A.P.Mackenzie,

QCEP scenario consistent with thermal conductivity: F. Ronning, et al. PRL 97, 067005 (2006)

Quantum criticality – a playground for new phases Quantum criticality concentrates the entropy: devices???



Science 325, #5946, 1360-1363 (2009).

Quantum criticality driving new order in the vicinity of the QCP



Often superconductivity...but what if superconductivity cannot form?

Quantum "dark matter"



Sr₃Ru₂O₇ "Disorder sensitive phase formation linked to metamagnetic quantum criticality": S. A. Grigera, P. Gegenwart, R. A. Borzi, F. Weickert, A. J. Schofield, R. S. Perry, T. Tayama, T. Sakakibara, Y. Maeno, A. G. Green, A. P. Mackenzie, Science **306**, 1154 (2004) Metal-to-Metal transition seen in susceptibility, dc magnetization, resistivity, magnetostriction.

• URu₂Si₂ , Sr₃Ru₂O₇, Cuprates, ...

Condensed dark matter: matter that has a thermodynamic effect but whose order parameter is transparent to current probes.

Resistivity anisotropy appears... as if magnetic field aligns domains



R.A. Borzi, S. A. Grigera, J. Farell, R.S.Parry, S. J. S. Lister, S. L. Lee, D. A. Tennant, Y. Maeno, A. P. Mackenzie, Science, **315**, 214 (2007).









Dark order states as magnetic analogues of unconventional superconductors

A. J. Schofield phys. stat. sol. (b) 247, #3, 563-569 (2010).

Superconductors: part-part

Conventional: s-wave

$$\Delta = \sum_{k,k',\sigma} V_{k,k'} \langle c^{\dagger}_{k'\sigma} c^{\dagger}_{-k'\bar{\sigma}} \rangle$$

Unconventional: *p*-wave, *d*-wave,...

$$\Delta(k) = \sum_{k,k',\sigma} V_{k,k'} \langle c^{\dagger}_{k'\sigma} c^{\dagger}_{-k'\bar{\sigma}} \rangle$$

Inhomogeneous: FFLO

$$\Delta(q) = \sum_{k,k',\sigma} V_{k,k'} \langle c^{\dagger}_{k'+q/2,\sigma} c^{\dagger}_{-k'+q/2,\bar{\sigma}} \rangle$$

Magnets: part-hole

Conventional: Stoner ferromagnetism

$$M = \sum_{k,\sigma,\sigma'} g_{\sigma,\sigma'} \langle c_{k\sigma}^{\dagger} c_{k\sigma'} \rangle$$

"Pomeranchuk": *p*-wave, *d*-wave,...

$$M(k) = \sum_{k,\sigma,\sigma'} g_{k,k';\sigma,\sigma'} \langle c_{k'\sigma}^{\dagger} c_{k'\sigma'} \rangle$$

Inhomogeneous: "spirals", density waves

$$M(q) = \sum_{k,\sigma} g_{k,k';\sigma,\sigma'} \langle c^{\dagger}_{k'+q/2,\sigma} c_{k'-q/2,\sigma'} \rangle$$



Mixed State

Spin textured state

Predictions: magnetic analogues of unconventional superconductors should show strong disorder dependence

A. F. Ho and A. J. Schofield EPL 84, #2, 27007 (2008).



No systematic studies. Existing data from S. A. Grigera

Can we make Kondo lattice look-alike?

- Evidence from d-metals of some resonance with the Landau-Ginzburg-Wilson-Hertz view of quantum criticality
- Can we create quantum criticalty in a Kondo lattice "lookalike"?

Kondo breakdown in a look-alike?

 Bilayers of ³He: Michael Neumann, Ján Nyéki, Brian Cowan and John Saunders Science **317**, #5843, 1356-1359 (2007).





Figure from A. Benlagra and C. Pepin, PRB, 79, 045112 (2009)

Kondo breakdown in a look-alike?

• Bilayers of ³He:

Michael Neumann, Ján Nyéki, Brian Cowan and John Saunders Science **317**, #5843, 1356-1359 (2007).



Kondo breakdown in a look-alike?

• Bilayers of ³He:

Michael Neumann, Ján Nyéki, Brian Cowan and John Saunders Science **317**, #5843, 1356-1359 (2007).



Evidence of quantum criticality in a Kondo like system: does it resemble heavy fermion anomalous quantum critical points?

Future Trends and Perspectives

- Developments in materials:
 - Epitaxial growth [c.f. *H. Shishido et al.* Science **327**, #5968, 980-983 (2010).
- Developments in look-alikes:
 - Quantum critical d-metals, oxides, organics...
 - Realizing an Anderson lattice in a semiconductor
 - Realizing an Anderson lattice in a cold atomic gas
- Developments in experiments:
 - ARPES, tunnelling, high field facilities
 - How could we use the new field of quantum metrology?

• Inspiration 1: Kondo dots



Andrei Kogan, Sami Amasha, M. A. Kastner Science **304**, #5675, 1293-1295 (2004).





M. Kastner (1993)

Van der Wiel et al. Science 289, 2105 (2004)

For a review, see M. Pustilnik and L. I. Glasman: cond-mat/0501007.

Could you make a lattice of Coulomb blockaded dots?



- Tunnelling between a 2D system (known probe) and a 1D wire (unknown subject).
- Smooth interface: momentum conserved along wire
- Transverse magnetic field tunes relative momentum

Inspiration 2: Bilayer 2DEGs used to probe Luttinger liquid behaviour



Y. Jompol, C. J. B. Ford, J. P. Griffiths, I. Farrer, G. A. C. Jones, D. Anderson, D. A. Ritchie, T. W. Silk and A. J. Schofield Science **325**, #5940, 597-601 (2009).

Achieving a single channel wire:



Finally – dispersing spinons and holons



• See spinon and holon beyond the universal region.

Y. Jompol, C. J. B. Ford, J. P. Griffiths, I. Farrer, G. A. C. Jones, D. Anderson, D. A. Ritchie, T. W. Silk and A. J. Schofield Science **325**, #5940, 597-601 (2009).











Would be a very dilute Anderson/Kondo lattice – can we improve this?

Cold quantum gases as quantum simulators

• Remarkable developments in cold quantum gases



 Ultimate control of the Hamiltonian – lattice shape, interactions etc.

The hand of Landau...



...becomes the hand of the experimentalist (changes are adiabatic).

Image: http://www.lens.unifi.it

• Inspiration: the (Fermi) Hubbard model in cold atomic gases



U. Schneider, L. Hackermüller, S. Will, Th. Best, I. Bloch, T. A. Costi, R. W. Helmes, D. Rasch and A. Rosch Science **322**, #5907, 1520-1525 (2008).

• Inspiration: the (Fermi) Hubbard model in cold atomic gases



U. Schneider, L. Hackermüller, S. Will, Th. Best, I. Bloch, T. A. Costi, R. W. Helmes, D. Rasch and A. Rosch Science **322**, #5907, 1520-1525 (2008).

• Idea 1: a tuned optical lattice



• Idea 1: a shaped optical lattice (multi-chroic lasers)



• Idea 2: A bilayer – with K. Bongs



Like the semiconductor bilayer but created with standing waves of light and an imaging system on the top layer.

Developments in experiments

Can we make use of high precision optical frequencies?
 Hansch and Hall – Nobel prize in 2005

VOLUME 85, NUMBER 11

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS

11 September 2000

Optical Frequency Synthesizer for Precision Spectroscopy

R. Holzwarth, Th. Udem, and T. W. Hänsch Max-Planck-Institut für Quantenoptik, Hans-Kopfermann-Straße 1, 85748 Garching, Germany

J.C. Knight, W.J. Wadsworth, and P.St.J. Russell

Optoelectronics Group, Department of Physics, University of Bath, Claverton Down, Bath BA2 7AY, United Kingdom (Received 4 May 2000)

We have used the frequency comb generated by a femtosecond mode-locked laser and broadened to more than an optical octave in a photonic crystal fiber to realize a frequency chain that links a 10 MHz radio frequency reference phase-coherently in one step to the optical region. By comparison with a similar frequency chain we set an upper limit for the uncertainty of this new approach to 5.1×10^{-16} . This opens the door for measurement and synthesis of virtually any optical frequency and is ready to revolutionize frequency metrology.

Summary and conclusions

- All the world of strong correlation physics seems to be contained in the Heavy Fermions
- Many open puzzles still remain
- Can some be solved by understanding heavy fermion lookalikes?
- Future trends:
 - Dilute Kondo lattices in semiconductors
 - Kondo lattices in cold atoms
 - New experiments